Academic Supervision in Integrated Islamic Elementary Schools During the COVID-19 Pandemic

Irnie Victorynie,¹ Azam Bin Othman,² Ismail Sheikh Ahmad,³ Suhailah Binti Hussien,⁴

¹,²,³,⁴International Islamic University Malaysia (IIUM), Malaysia,
¹Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi, Indonesia
¹victorynie@gmail.com, ²azam_othman@iium.edu.my, ³drismail@iium.edu.my,
⁴suhailah@iium.edu.my
*Corresponding Author

Abstract

The COVID-19 pandemic has significantly impacted the education sector, including the execution of academic supervision in schools. This study investigates the academic supervision in two integrated Islamic elementary schools in Bekasi, Indonesia, during the COVID-19 pandemic. The research method employed a qualitative research design as a case study. The methodological triangulation included interviews, academic supervision observations, and document analysis used to collect data. A total of two informants were the principals from integrated Islamic elementary schools, which were purposefully chosen based on their academic supervision expertise. The data from the interviews were transcribed. Then, the data was examined using the Atlas.ti software program based on theme analysis. Following that, we carried out coding procedures and interpretation. The findings revealed that academic supervision was still carried out before the pandemic, albeit with certain limitations. Principals begin by arranging academic supervision plans and organizing a team of school supervisors. Moreover, this study highlighted a new model of applying academic supervision procedures at schools amid the pandemic.

Keywords: Academic Supervision, Online Supervision, Supervisory Leadership

Introduction

Countries are forced to close their schools due to the COVID-19 pandemic. According to UNESCO, at least 39 nations, including Indonesia, have shuttered their schools to prevent the virus from spreading.¹ Furthermore, the Minister of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia, Nadiem Makarim, stated, “UNESCO reported that school closures affected around 1.6 billion pupils and 63 million educators globally. We

are seeing the hardships of exceptional instructors. Teachers prefer to continue teaching despite these obstacles rather than pupils not obtaining any learning at all”.

Due to school closures, conducting the education process amid the COVID-19 pandemic is a significant challenge, particularly for educators in Indonesia. As a result, Indonesia’s President, Joko Widodo, urged teachers to maintain enthusiasm in delivering instruction to all students. Even though teachers are in terrible circumstances due to the COVID-19 pandemic, their enthusiasm for teaching must be displayed. Students will be motivated as a result, even if they solely learn at home.

According to the president of Indonesia’s remark above, teachers are the primary focus of attention in implementing education since the teacher is essential to the teaching and learning process. Additionally, to achieve educational goals in the form of optimal student development, the role of the profession of a teacher in the overall education program in schools is realized. As a result, a teacher’s ability to perform his tasks dramatically impacts the quality of education. Similarly, educators are an essential component in the effectiveness of education in schools since they are the source of teaching and learning activities.

The role of teachers in schools is required to achieve educational goals in the form of optimal student development. Likewise, Tanner and Tanner also underline that good schools are impossible without good teachers. It is possible to argue that teachers’ ability significantly impacts the quality of education. It is important to note that according to Laws of Republic Indonesia Number 14 the Year 2005, teachers are professional educators

---

7 Zainal Aqib, Profesionalisme Guru Dalam Pembelajaran (Surabaya: Insan Cendekia, 2012).
whose significant responsibility is to educate, teach, guide, lead, train, and evaluate students through formal, primary, and secondary education.9

Unfortunately, Indonesia is still dealing with a significant teacher problem. According to Reni Marlinawati, Deputy Chairperson Commission X of the House of Representatives (DPR) Republic of Indonesia, one of the teacher problems in Indonesia is relatively low teacher performance. In Indonesia, the level of education index is generally flat and even begins to deteriorate. As a result, teachers must be given greater attention.10

One alternative for overcoming teacher issues is to develop a professional support program that includes guidance, consultation, assistance, and other related activities known as academic supervision. Kartini et al. found a strong relationship between principal leadership, academic supervision, and teacher performance in research on 128 secondary teachers in Banyuasin. That means the presence of a supervisor becomes crucial to improving teachers' competency.11 Specifically, Hoque found that directive supervision has a significant impact and is related to teachers’ performance.12 Moreover, academic supervision by the principal is also related to teachers’ perceptions.13 These several studies demonstrate the significance of academic supervision in teacher performance.14 Furthermore, Hoy and Forsyth, cited by Glatthorn, underline that instructional supervision is a set of actions to improve the teaching-learning process.15

Some schools in Indonesia have implemented supervision programs. However, the execution has been ineffective. It has been proven that there are still issues with carrying out the supervision program. According to Mardiyah, one of the concerns is that supervisors remain inadequate in academic supervision competencies. As a result, 

---

9 Rugaiyah Rugaiyah, Profesi Kependidikan Dalam Perspektif Manajemen Pendidikan (Bandung: Alfabeta, 2010).
supervisors must be aware of their tasks and responsibilities and possess the necessary supervisory competencies. Another inhibiting factor is teachers’ response to leadership performance, mainly to implementing e-supervision during the pandemic. Wiles and Bondi concur that supervisors must be able to view the teacher in order to plan staff development. Individual teacher development must be profiled to make progress sustainable and purposeful. Similarly, supervisors must comprehend how knowledge about adult and teacher development and different supervising approaches affects their work. That is in line with the finding of Imamah and Abdurrahman that the form of improving teacher performance as a result of academic supervision are teacher development, individual approach, work motivation, and teacher training.

Furthermore, the implementation of supervision in Indonesia continues to confront challenges, such as the implementation process being inconsistent with the aims and functions of supervision. Supervision exercises are often carried out solely to assess instructors and identify each teacher’s deficiencies. In contrast, supervision is carried out to identify teachers’ deficiencies in effective learning and implement the improvement process. According to Wiles and Bondi, excellent aid must be sought through supervision, and the delivery of such help must be related to the development of classroom instruction. Additionally, Pawlas and Oliva explain that instructional supervisors are those individuals who devote all of their time and energy to actively assisting instructors with the enhancement of instruction. Also, they highlight that the supervisor should be the one who directs individuals to think of new and better methods of doing things and to solve all of the teacher’s difficulties.

22 Wiles and Bondi, Supervision.
23 George E. Pawlas and Peter F. Oliva, Supervision for Today’s Schools (New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons, 2007).
Moreover, some principals have not performed well in their leadership roles, particularly in supervising and managing instructional programs. The principal is swamped with school administration responsibilities, and school supervisors cannot oversee teachers. Meanwhile, according to Komoski, as cited by Wiles and Bondi, supervision is a leadership process that aims to enhance instruction. Furthermore, Montgomery released a study by Fritz and Miller that found that most teachers had no foundation in adequate teaching theory. As a result, many teachers cannot establish an effective teaching structure. A program for strengthening the teaching process can be provided by effective leadership.

Meanwhile, supervision is one of the school’s efforts to increase teachers’ competency through a teaching and learning process improvement program. According to Glatthorn, supervision is what school employees do with persons and things to sustain or change school operations in ways that directly influence the teaching approach employed to assist student learning. Implementation of supervision needs to emphasize coaching and develop teacher competencies to improve the quality of learning and guidance for school students. As a result, the principal must be able to provide adequate assistance to teachers and solve the instructional obstacles they confront. Based on such thoughts, the principal should arrange an aid program for teachers in the form of academic supervisory leadership. It is necessary to handle issues and problems encountered by teachers and enhance teacher performance in all situations, including in pandemic eras, so that the teaching and learning process becomes more effective and productive. Consequently, the current study intends to investigate a model of implementation of academic supervision in two integrated Islamic elementary schools in Bekasi, Indonesia, amid the COVID-19 pandemic.

**Methods**

In this study, a qualitative research method was applied. Meanwhile, qualitative research is described as a method that seeks to understand the meaning of individuals or
how a group of people perceives a human or social problem.\textsuperscript{28} Similarly, qualitative research employs various methods and takes an interpretative, naturalistic approach to its subject. In other words, qualitative research observes items in their natural setting and attempts to make sense of or interpret occurrences in terms of their meaning. It is based on a person’s experience, introspection, live narrative interview, observation, history, interactions, and visual text-describing routine issue situations and their importance in their existence.\textsuperscript{29} Furthermore, qualitative research methodology might be anchored in grounded theory, ethnography, phenomenology, or case studies.\textsuperscript{30} As a result, the case study method is believed to be a good design for this study to collect data and examine how informants express their opinions and report the facts using their interpretations.

Purposive sampling is used in this study, which allows us to choose the best area and subject to examine. According to Patton, purposive sampling is extensively employed in qualitative research to find and choose informative situations for the most efficient use of limited resources.\textsuperscript{31} Two integrated Islamic elementary schools in Bekasi, Indonesia, that have been conducting academic supervision programs and teacher performance assessments for at least three years have been chosen to be investigated. The features of the principals chosen for this study include at least three years of experience as school leaders to guarantee that they have appropriate experience. Two principals from two separate integrated Islamic elementary schools were chosen as informants. In addition, we employed anomaly detection and codes, such as informant one and informant two, to keep track of the informants’ information. Furthermore, this study employed a triangulation data collection approach, with data acquired via documents, interviews, and observation.

We conducted a member check after the data collection was done. The informants could check a summary of their interview transcripts to ensure that they were accurate and thorough. Different data gathering was necessary to resolve differences. In addition, an essential component in the data collection process that we carried out was a pilot study. We performed a pilot study of the instrument to ensure its completeness. A pilot study also assisted us in rearranging the questions and ensuring they were appropriate. To analyze the data, we applied standard processes. We showed the phases in data analysis, such as


\textsuperscript{30} Creswell and Poth, \textit{Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design}.

preparing and organizing the data, reducing the data into themes using Atlas.ti software, and representing the data in networks.\textsuperscript{32}

\section*{Discussion}

Following the research questions, the findings are divided into three categories. Every section explains the research dimensions that are presented by the themes. The first section guides principals on planning academic supervision amid a pandemic. The second segment outlines team supervisors’ preparations in the face of the pandemic. The third portion deals with the implementation of academic supervision during the pandemic. The writers employed pseudonyms to save data from informants in interviews.

The authors discovered 13 themes. According to the findings, the first research question yielded four themes, the second research question yielded five themes, and the third one yielded four themes. The discussion of findings demonstrates the deep exploration of themes. These findings are primarily applied in the analysis of interview transcripts. The findings summarize the material about deploying academic supervisory leadership in pandemic circumstances. The research questions were analyzed alongside the interview's significant ideas and themes.

\subsection*{Guides Principals on Planning Academic Supervision amid the COVID-19 Pandemic}

The authors discovered four items to consider when planning academic supervision after examining the data gathered from the interviews with the two principals. These things were then divided into four themes.

\begin{table}[h]
\centering
\caption{The themes from research question 1}
\begin{tabular}{|l|l|}
\hline
Research Question 1 & Themes \\
\hline
How did principals plan academic supervision amid the pandemic? & Early year online meeting \\
& Supervision objectives \\
& Supervision schedules \\
& Supervision forms \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{table}

\subsubsection*{Early Year Online Meeting}

According to the interview, academic supervision planning for the COVID-19 pandemic took the shape of online meetings with teachers at the school. It should be noted that the planning was typically held before the beginning of the school year. This finding is evident from the second informant’s experience: “planning is usually done at the beginning

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
of the school year. Regarding the date of supervision, I am still looking at the situation first, all the circumstances. I thought, maybe, when I have free time to do it”.33

Additionally, the second informant’s remark is consistent with the findings of the observations. The principal communicated to supervisors and teachers through an early year school meeting. The goal of communication concerns preparing the academic supervision program for the academic year. Meanwhile, the meeting was held using the Zoom meeting application.

**Supervision Objectives**

It is clear from the informants that the planning process, which was carried out through an online meeting, began with identifying the objectives of conducting academic supervision. Furthermore, the results of the interviews were consistent with the data from the observations, indicating that defining the aims of supervision is the first step in planning academic supervision. This statement is supported by Yan, who asserted: “formulating supervision objectives is part of our first planning stage, ma’am. In my understanding, supervision is not only about assessment, so it is necessary to define the purpose first”.34

**Supervision Schedules**

The first informants noted that after identifying the aims of academic supervision, the planning process was continued by developing a supervision schedule for teachers. Academic supervision was scheduled to be implemented for one academic year. As a result, the supervision schedule created has become a guideline for the timeline of implementing academic supervision. That is appropriate with the informant's statement that “we then do the scheduling. Aa..we arrange a supervision schedule for each teacher. Usually made during the school year”.35

**Supervision Forms**

Informant one went on to say that during planning, the principal prepared the forms that supervisors would utilize to provide academic supervision to teachers. At the same

---

33 Informant B, Interview, June 17, 2021.
34 Informant A, Interview, July 1, 2021.
35 Informant A.
time, the district education office had developed the format that schools used in academic supervision.

“There are already supervision forms issued by the district education office. So, we refer to those forms, and the supervision aspects only follow those forms as well. Also, the assessment is based on data from the district education office”.

Similarly, the second informant acknowledged that the district education office provided academic supervision forms to be used as a guide in supervising teachers at schools.

“Supervision forms that the district education office gave me, I use to supervise teachers what is called aa.. it gives me a form regarding what I should supervise the teacher”.

Based on the research findings, principals carried out academic supervision program planning differently than usual. All series of planning were conducted online. This fact shows that the COVID-19 pandemic requires principals to utilize technology in their duties, including implementing academic supervision programs. Based on that, the principals should also do some realignment of resource and network technology to develop their role as a supervisor and understand how to apply the supervision process in a highly digital context properly.

The Outlines Team Supervisors’ Preparations in the Face of the Pandemic

Similar to the model in the previous section, in this section, we discovered five-item to consider when the outlines team supervisors’ preparations in the face of the pandemic after examining the data gathered from the interviews with the two principals. These things were then divided into five themes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Question 2</th>
<th>Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How did principals prepare team supervisors amid the pandemic?</td>
<td>Senior teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vice principals and certified teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Supervisor Letter of Decree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Briefing and Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Developing same perceptions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

36 Informant A.
37 Informant B. Interview.
Team Supervisors

It is vital to make clear that all teachers in the school receive academic supervision. Every school has a large number of teachers. As a result, the principal must assemble a team of supervisors to supervise teachers. According to the first informant, a supervisory team comprised several senior teachers.

“The team of supervisors formed at the school usually chooses from a senior teacher, Mrs. Irnie. This consideration is based on the experience of senior teachers for years; of course, their skills and knowledge are different”.  
On the other hand, the second informant was in a slightly different position in that team supervisors were chosen from a pool of vice principals and certified teachers.

“I chose a supervisory team from two groups. The first is the vice principal at my school, who teaches no more than 24 hours, so maybe I have time. Second, I chose a certified teacher. So, if teachers have received certification, they have more tasks and functions to assess their friends than other teachers”. 

Letter of Decree

Furthermore, after the principal constituted the supervisor team, the principal released a Supervisor Letter of Decree. It is discernible based on the experiences of the first informant.

“So, for supervisors, it is not only a personal determination, but a decree confirms it from the principal. The decree which legally appoints and assigns the names in the decree attachment, as part of the supervisory team”. 

Findings from interviews concerning letters of the decree issued by the principal are corroborated by documents gathered, namely letters of degree appointing school team supervisors.

Briefing and Discussion

After the supervisor’s team was organized, they were not immediately assigned the authority to supervise teachers. They made preparations ahead of time to ensure that the implementation of academic supervision went smoothly and successfully. The principal leads the preparatory process for the supervisory team. According to the second informant, one aspect of preparation was briefing activities between the principal and the supervisory team.

“For teachers who are given the task of being school supervisors, there must be a briefing, like that, briefing yes, that is what I mean first, briefing supervisors.”

39 Informant A, Interview. 
40 Informant B, Interview. 
41 Informant A, Interview.
Furthermore, as stated by the first informant, supervisors were prepared through discussions between the principal and the supervisors.

“It cannot be said that special training for supervisors. It is only limited to a joint discussion between the supervisors and me. During the discussion, I conveyed several rules regarding supervision that I understand, what targets must be met, with an emphasis that carrying out supervision is not only for us to carry out assessments, and what approaches can be applied later”. 43

Developing Same Perceptions

Additionally, the first informant provided a point about supervisors’ preparations. The informant stressed the importance of the principal developing the same perception among supervisors regarding implementing academic supervision.

“If I may say there is no special training that we provide to supervisors. So, in the form of general directions. Mrs. Irnie. We studied the supervision forms together with the supervisor’s team. We try to learn one by one from the forms if there is something that is not understood from the forms”. 44

Furthermore, all supervisors must recognize that supervisors are those individuals who devote all of their time and effort to directly assisting teachers with the enhancement of instruction. 45 Likewise, the principal must convey to supervisors that supervision is what school employees do with people and that things to sustain or modify school operations directly affect the teaching method used to support student learning. The implementation of supervision emphasizes guiding and professional development to improve the quality of learning and guidance in schools. 46

The Implementation of Academic Supervision During the COVID-19 Pandemic

In this section, we discovered four items to consider when implementing academic supervision during the COVID-19 pandemic after examining the data gathered from the interviews with the two principals. These things were then divided into five themes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3. The themes from research question 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Research Question 3</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How did principals conduct academic supervision amid the pandemic?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

42 Informant B, Interview.
43 Informant A, Interview.
44 Informant A.
45 Pawlas and Oliva, *Supervision for Today’s Schools*.
46 Glatthorn, *Supervisory Leadership*.
Online Academic Supervision

The COVID-19 pandemic seems to influence education significantly, and all schools have fought to continue the teaching and learning process despite limits and emergencies. Even still, schools are attempting to carry out academic supervision, even though it has been modified to fit the circumstances. The first informant, for example, has done online academic supervision at his school.

“During this pandemic, the implementation of academic supervision was carried out well. We have the class zoom and school email, which can be used for supervision purposes. With online supervision, we can also go in and see each class”.47

Online Class Visits

The first informant pointed out that the technique of class visits for academic supervision was completed online—the supervisor engaged in the online teaching and learning process with the teachers. For instance, a supervisor attended a Zoom Meeting of a particular class and then observed the learning activities in Zoom Meeting. Another apparent effort by the supervisor was a visit to the Google Classroom of each class.

“Supervisors can find out how the teacher assigns assignments to students and what the assignments are. Supervisors can join and enter. They can also see and supervise directly from the Google Classroom they have created”.48

Lesson Plan Pandemic Version

Another point raised by the first informant was that his school had a pandemic version of the lesson plan.

“There is a slight difference in making the lesson plan, which you can see later, ma'am. Learning activities at home are also included in the lesson plan. So we cannot use the usual lesson plans”.49

Similarly, it was discovered that the second informant utilized a modified version of the lesson plan, which consisted of simply one sheet.

“We get directions from the government, especially from the Minister of Education, regarding using lesson plan one sheet. Then, it immediately became our discussion at school. Teachers are given directions to make one sheet of RPP according to the direction of the Minister”.50

---

47 Informant A, Interview.
48 Informant A.
49 Informant A.
50 Informant B, Interview.
Online Training Program

Another result from the interview was that the first informant offered a teacher training program. For illustration, the supervisor has provided training on using Google Classroom.

“Because we are not familiar with Google Classroom, we are holding, what is it called, a short training about Google Classroom. Some teachers already know about Google Classroom but are not proficient at using it. At that time, the training started in the form of small groups to large groups, learning various things from Google Classroom, then how to make learning videos”. 51

The second informant stated that the principal supplied teacher training sessions, although the country was in the grip of a COVID-19 pandemic. The Zoom meeting application was used for teacher training.

“Before the pandemic, we usually held training, gathered in one place. There are changes during the pandemic. Training via zoom, zoom meeting. That is what continues to be done, including for learning subjects”. 52

Based on the findings, it is evident that the use of technology was intended to facilitate the task of principals as academic supervisors. Furthermore, supervisory procedures have to be adjusted for online learning. This trend toward virtualized education undoubtedly necessitated the creation of new methods to supervise, regulate, counsel, and lead the whole school community to produce interactive models and successful and suitable virtual training. 53

Additionally, academic supervision using technology would undoubtedly assist school principals in guiding and training teachers to develop their professional competence even during the COVID-19 phase, when supervision could not be done directly or face-to-face. Employing advanced technology for academic supervision is one solution to the difficulty of implementing academic supervision. 54

Conclusion

Even though the COVID-19 pandemic is tempering the world, the quality of education should still be emphasized. Principals must strive to maintain educational quality
by focusing more on teachers. Implementing an academic supervision program is one way to maintain the quality of teachers’ instructions. Due to the current state of the COVID-19 pandemic, academic supervision is being implemented slightly differently than in the past. It begins with the academic supervision program’s planning process. During the planning process, principals identify the objectives of academic supervision, create a schedule for academic supervision, and prepare the necessary forms for academic supervision administration. The process then begins by assembling a supervisor team following the specified criteria. Following that, the implementation of online academic supervision, online supervision techniques, and even a pandemic version of the lesson plan.

References


